



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

MISCELLANY

I

THE EPISCOPAL ANCESTRY OF THE CATHOLIC HIERARCHY IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

In the last number of the CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW (October, 1916, p. 307), a writer mentions "the remarkable fact *that the episcopal hierarchy now ruling in the United States*, in England and Australia, *all* derive their origin from the famous English Benedictine, Bishop Charles Walmesley." He refers to a note in the CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW of October, 1915 (p. 253), which says that "leaving Ireland out of it, *the rest of the English-speaking world has its faith and orders* from Downside. . . . The case of America is clear. Bishop Walmesley consecrated Bishop Carroll, who, as first Bishop of Baltimore, will have ordained many to all the grades of Holy Orders and no doubt consecrated other bishops." In fact, on page 243, Lulworth Castle is called "the scene of the consecration of Dr. John Carroll and *the birthplace of the American Episcopate.*" The writer of the article on the same famous Lulworth Castle in the *American Catholic Quarterly Review*, 1889, page 63, calls Bishop Walmesley "the link which *binds the Church of the United States* to the Church of St. Austin and St. Gregory." In the *Lives of the Deceased Bishops of America* by Richard Clarke, Bishop Carroll is simply called *the founder of the American Hierarchy*. (Vol. i, p. 32.) An article on Bishop Walmesley in the *American Catholic Historical Researches* (Vol. xxi, 1897, p. 185) is headed *The Patriarch of the American Hierarchy*.

Now, with all due respect for the esteemed writers above-mentioned, and with all the veneration and affection that Bishop Carroll may justly claim from every bishop of the United States, I venture to say that *at present*, at least, general statements like those above which I have put in italics, are no longer correct and ought to be modified. I would not object if they were restricted to the *early* or *primitive* or *original* hierarchy of Church of the United States. But it is hardly correct that "the episcopal hierarchy *now ruling in the United States* . . . *all* derive their origin from . . . Bishop Charles Walmesley." In proof of my position, I offer the following list of the archbishops and bishops of the United States, who do not descend hierarchically from Bishop Carroll, beginning with the year 1808 and ending with 1900.

Before examining the list it may be well to keep in mind the dates of some events in the expansion of the territory of the United States, which bear also on the expansion of its Catholic Hierarchy. After the peace treaty of 1783 the United States comprised nearly all the territory east of the Mississippi, excepting Florida, that is the thirteen original States with the territory they claimed beyond their actual possessions. Louisiana with its vast territory from the Gulf of Mexico to the frontier of Oregon came into the Union in 1803. Oregon was claimed by the United States as early as 1813; but England held undivided

control of it until 1818, when it consented to consider Oregon as a kind of common or neutral land. It was only in 1846 that the United States obtained undisputed possession of it. Florida came in 1819, Texas in 1845, and upper California as late as 1848. All this bears on the history of the Dioceses of the great Northwest and the land west of the Mississippi to the Pacific.

Bishop Carroll was consecrated on August 15, 1790, and died as Archbishop of Baltimore on December 3, 1815. During his episcopacy he consecrated Bishop Neale as his coadjutor, December 7, 1800; Bishop Egan (Philadelphia), October 28, 1810; Bishop Cheverus (Boston), November 1, 1810, and Bishop Flaget (Bardstown), November 4, 1810. During his life time, were consecrated at Rome, Italy, the two bishops of New York, Concanen (1808), and Connolly (1814).

There are several ways of tabulating or recording our Episcopal Succession; but the plainest manner of presenting it seems to be by giving, *in chronological order*, first the names of the Archbishops (in capitals) and of the Bishops with their last See, then the date and place of their consecration, and lastly the name of their consecrator.

Concanen, New York, April 24, 1808. Rome. Cardinal di Pietro.

Connolly, New York, November 6, 1814. Rome. Cardinal Brancadora.

Dubourg, New Orleans, September 24, 1815. Rome. Cardinal Doria Pamfili.

Kelly, Richmond, August 24, 1820. Kilkenny, Ireland. Bishop Troy, Dublin.

England, Charleston, September 21, 1820. Cork, Ireland. Bishop Murray, Cork.

Conwell, Philadelphia, September 24, 1820. London, England. Bishop Poynter, V. Ap.

Rosati, St. Louis, March 25, 1824. Donaldsonville, La. Bishop Dubourg.

Portier, Mobile, November 5, 1826. St. Louis. Bishop Rosati.

De Neckere, New Orleans, May 24, 1830. New Orleans. Bishop Rosati.

Rese, Detroit, October 6, 1833. Cincinnati. Bishop Rosati.

Clancey, Charleston, December 21, 1834. Carlow, Ireland. Bishop Nolan, Kildare.

BLANC, New Orleans, November 22, 1835. New Orleans. Bishop Rosati.

Loras, Dubuque, December 10, 1837. Mobile. Bishop Portier.

Miles, Nashville, September 16, 1838. St. Rose Convent, Ky. Bishop Rosati.

Hailandiere, Vincennes, August 18, 1839. Paris, France. Bishop Forbin-Janson.

KENRICK, P. R. St. Louis, November 30, 1841. Philadelphia. Bishop Rosati.

ODIN, New Orleans, March 6, 1842. New Orleans. Bishop Blanc.

O'Connor, Pittsburgh, August 15, 1843. Rome. Cardinal Fransoni.

BLANCHET, F. N. Oregon, July 25, 1845. Montreal. Bishop Bourget.

Blanchet, A. M. Nesqually, September 27, 1846. Montreal. Bishop Bourget.

Bazin, Vincennes, October 24, 1847. Vincennes. Bishop Portier.

Demers, Vancouver, November 30, 1847. St. Paul, Oregon. Archbishop Blanchet.

St. Palais, Vincennes, January 14, 1849. Vincennes. Bishop Miles.

Vandevelde, Natchez, February 11, 1849. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.

ALEMANY, San Francisco, June 30, 1850. Rome. Cardinal Fransoni.

McGill, Richmond, November 10, 1850. Bardstown. Archbishop Kenrick.

Cretin, St. Paul, January 26, 1851. Bellay, France. Bishop Devie.

Miege, Kansas City, Kans., March 25, 1851. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.

- BAILEY, Baltimore, October 30, 1853. New York. Archbishop Bedini, Ap. Legate.
- De Goesbriand, Burlington, October 30, 1853. New York. Archbishop Bedini, Ap. Legate.
- Loughlin, Brooklyn, October 30, 1853. New York. Archbishop Bedini, Ap. Legate.
- Martin, Natchitoches, November 30, 1853. New Orleans. Archbishop Blanc.
- Amat, Monterey, March 12, 1854. Rome. Cardinal Fransoni.
- Persico, Savannah, June 4, 1854. Bombay, India. Bishop Hartman.
- O'Regan, Chicago, July 25, 1854. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- Duggan, Chicago, May 3, 1857. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- Smyth, Dubuque, May 3, 1857. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- O'Gorman, Omaha, May 8, 1859. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- Whelan, Nashville, May 8, 1859. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- Grace, St. Paul, July 24, 1859. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- Quinlan, Mobile, December 4, 1859. New Orleans. Archbishop Blanc.
- Dufal, Coadjutor, Galveston, November 25, 1860. Le Mans, France. Bishop Guibert, later Cardinal Archbishop of Paris.
- O'Connell, Grass Valley, February 3, 1861. All Hallows, Ireland. Bishop Cullen, later Cardinal Archbishop of Dublin.
- Dubuis, Galveston, November 23, 1862. Lyons, France. Archbishop Odin.
- FEEHAN, Chicago, November 1, 1865. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- HENNESSY, Dubuque, September 30, 1866. Dubuque. Archbishop Kenrick.
- McCloskey, Louisville, May 24, 1868. Rome. Cardinal Reisach.
- Melcher, Green Bay, July 12, 1868. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- Lootens, Idaho, August 9, 1868. San Francisco. Archbishop Alemany.
- Hogan, Kansas City, September 13, 1868. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- SALPOINTE, Santa Fe, June 20, 1869. Clermont, France. Bishop Feron.
- Foley, Chicago, February 27, 1870. Baltimore. Bishop W. G. McCloskey.
- Fink, Lavenworth, June 11, 1871. Chicago. Bishop Foley.
- RYAN, Philadelphia, April 14, 1872. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
- GROSS, Oregon, April 27, 1873. Baltimore. Archbishop Bailey.
- SEGHERS, Oregon, June 29. Victoria. Archbishop Blanchet.
- Mora, Monterey, August 3, 1873. Monterey. Bishop Amat.
- KAIN, St. Louis, May 23, 1875. Wheeling, Va. Archbishop Bailey.
- IRELAND, St. Paul, December 21, 1875. St. Paul. Bishop Grace.
- O'Connor, Omaha, August 20, 1876. Philadelphia. Archbishop Ryan.
- LERAY, New Orleans, April 22, 1877. Rennes, France. Cardinal St. Marc.
- Chatard, Indianapolis, May 12, 1878. Rome. Cardinal Fransoni.
- Juenger, Nesqually, October 28, 1879. Vancouver. Archbishop Blanchet.
- Brondel, Helena, December 14, 1879. Victoria. Archbishop Seghers.
- Marty, Sioux Falls, February 1, 1880. Ferdinand, Ind. Bishop Chatard.
- Monogue, Sacramento, January 16, 1881. San Francisco. Archbishop Alemany.
- McMullen, Davenport, July 25, 1881. Chicago. Archbishop Feehan.
- Rademacher, Fort Wayne, June 24, 1883. Nashville. Archbishop Feehan.
- RIORDAN, San Francisco, September 16, 1883. Chicago. Archbishop Feehan.
- Cosgrove, Davenport, September 14, 1884. Davenport. Archbishop Feehan.
- Durier, Natchitoches, March 19, 1885. New Orleans. Archbishop Leray.
- Phelan, Pittsburgh, August 2, 1885. Pittsburgh. Archbishop Ryan.
- Scanlan, Salt Lake, June 29, 1887. San Francisco. Archbishop Riordan.
- Burke, St. Joseph, October 28, 1887. Chicago. Archbishop Feehan.

Matz, Denver, October 28, 1887. Denver. Archbishop Salpointe.
 Bonacum, Lincoln, November 30, 1887. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
 Scannell, Omaha, November 30, 1887. Nashville. Archbishop Feehan.
 Janssen, Belleville, April 25, 1888. Belleville. Archbishop Feehan.
 Lemmens, Vancouver Island, August 5, 1888. Victoria. Archbishop Gross.
 Hennessy, Wichita, November 30, 1888. St. Louis. Archbishop Kenrick.
 Zardetti, St. Cloud, October 20, 1889. Einsiedeln, Switzerland. Archbishop Gross.¹
 Cotter, Winona, December 27, 1889. St. Paul. Archbishop Ireland.
 McGolrick, Duluth, December 27, 1889. St. Paul. Archbishop Ireland.
 Shanley, Fargo, December 27, 1889. St. Paul. Archbishop Ireland.
 Verdaguer, Brownsville, November 9, 1890. Barcelona, Spain. Bishop Calala y Albora.
 MESSMER, Milwaukee, March 27, 1892. Newark, N. J. Bishop Zardetti.
 Dunne, Dallas, November 30, 1893. Chicago. Archbishop Feehan.
 Montgomery, Monterey, April 8, 1894. San Francisco. Archbishop Riordan.
 Hoban, Scranton, March 22, 1896. Scranton. Monsignor Satolli, Ap. Del.
 Grace, Sacramento, June 16, 1896. Sacramento. Archbishop Riordan.
 GLENNON, St. Louis, June 29, 1896. Kansas City, Mo. Archbishop Kain.
 O'Dea, Seattle, September 8, 1896. Vancouver. Archbishop Gross.
 Lenihan, Cheyenne, February 24, 1897. Dubuque. Archbishop Hennessy.
 PRENDERGAST, Philadelphia, February 24, 1897. Philadelphia. Archbishop Ryan.
 Trobec, St. Cloud, September 21, 1897. St. Paul. Archbishop Ireland.
 Fitzmaurice, Erie, February 24, 1898. Philadelphia. Archbishop Ryan.
 CHRISTIE, Oregon, July 29, 1898. St. Paul. Archbishop Ireland.
 Cunningham, Concordia, September 21, 1898. Leavenworth. Archbishop Kain.
 McGavick, Auxiliary, Chicago, May 1, 1899. Chicago. Archbishop Feehan.
 Shanahan, J. W., Harrisburg, May 1, 1899. Philadelphia. Archbishop Ryan.

The following schema gives a conspectus of the principal successions exhibited in the above list:

Dubourg consecrated Rosati.
 Rosati consecrated Blanc, De Neckere, P. R. Kenrick, Miles, Portier, Rese.
 Blanc consecrated Odin, Martin, Quinlan.
 Portier consecrated Bazin, Loras.
 Kenrick consecrated Bonacum, Duggan, Feehan, Grace (St. Paul), Hennessy (Dubuque), Hennessy (Wichita), Hogan, McGill, Melchers, Miege, O'Gorman, O'Regan, Ryan (Philadelphia), Smyth, Vandevelde, Whelan.
 Feehan consecrated Burke (S. Jos.), Cosgrove, Dunne (Dallas), Janssen (Bell).
 McMullen, Rademacher, Riordan, Scannell.
 Grace consecrated Ireland.
 Ireland consecrated Christie, Keane Jas., Cotter, Shanley, and all the present bishops of the province of St. Paul, except Bishop O'Gorman of Sioux Falls.
 Ryan consecrated Fitzmaurice, O'Connor (Omaha), Phelan, Prendergast.

¹ Reuss' data on Bishop Zardetti are wrong, I am certain, having been present at his consecration and when he received subdeaconship and deaconship. The data furnished by Bishops Zardetti and Marty were, no doubt, correct, but were badly mixed by the printer.

Riordan consecrated Grace (Sacramento), Montgomery, Scanlan.

Bailey consecrated Gross, Kain.

Gross consecrated Lemmens, O'Dea, Zardetti.

Blanchet consecrated Demers, Seghers, Juenger.

The list also discloses the interesting fact that, during the first thirty years since Carroll's consecration (1790-1820), out of the *ten* members of the then American Hierarchy *four* did not derive their consecration from Bishop Carroll; that of the *thirty* bishops living in the United States during the first fifty years of the American Hierarchy (1790-1840) *fourteen* (in italics) did not link with Carroll, as the following schema shows:

Neale, 1800. Cheverus, Egan, Flaget, 1810. *Connolly*, 1814. *Dubourg*, 1815. *Maréchal*, 1817. David, 1819. *Conwell*, *England*, *Kelly*, 1820. Edw. Fenwick, 1822. *Rosati*, 1824. B. J. Fenwick, 1825. Dubois, *Portier*, 1826. Whitfield, 1828. F. P. Kenrick, *De Neckere*, 1830, *Rese*, Purcell, 1833, Brute, Eccleston, Chabrat, *Clancy*. 1834. *Blanc*, 1835. *Loras*, 1837. Hughes, *Miles*, 1838. *Hailandière*, 1839. There was no consecration in 1840, except that of Garcia Diego Moreno, Bishop of California, which was however, not United States territory at that time. Bishop Concanen, too, is left out.

The following two schemas show the episcopal genealogy of the present Archbishops of the United States.

I. DERIVING CONSECRATION FROM BISHOP CARROLL

1. Cardinal Gibbons, 1868, by M. J. Spalding—Flaget—Carroll.
2. Cardinal Farley, 1895, Corrigan—McCloskey—Dubois—Maréchal—Cheverus—Carroll.
3. Archbishop Blenk, 1899, by Chapelle—Gibbons.
4. Archbishop Moeller, 1900, by Elder—F. P. Kenrick—Flaget.
5. Archbishop Pitaval, 1902, by Bourgade—Lamy—M. J. Spalding.
6. Archbishop Mundelein, 1909, by Bishop McDonnell—Corrigan.

II. DERIVING CONSECRATION FROM BISHOP DUBOURG AND ROMAN PRELATES

1. Cardinal O'Connell, 1901, by Cardinal Satolli.
2. Archbishop Ireland, 1875, by Grace—P. R. Kenrick—Rosati—Dubourg.
3. Archbishop Messmer, 1892, by Zardetti—Gross—Bailey—Bedini.
4. Archbishop Glennon, 1896, by Hogan—P. R. Kenrick.
5. Archbishop Prendergast, 1897, by Ryan—P. R. Kenrick.
6. Archbishop Christie, 1898, by Ireland.
7. Archbishop Keane, Jas., 1902, by Ireland.
8. Archbishop Hanna, 1912, by Msgr. Bonzano, Apostolic Delegate.

There are at present four titular Archbishops of the United States who do not exercise any episcopal jurisdiction. These are:

Keane, John Jos., resigned Archbishop of Dubuque, consecrated August 25, 1878, in Baltimore, by Archbishop Gibbons.

Weber, Jos., Delegate General of the Resurrectionist Fathers, Chicago, consecrated at Lemberg, Galicia in Austria, December 30, 1895, by Archbishop Morawski of Lemberg.

Seton, Robert, at present at Pau, France, consecrated in July, 1903, at Rome by Cardinal Respighi.

Kennedy, Thos., Rector of the American College, Rome, consecrated December 29, 1907, at Rome by Cardinal Gotti.

It may not be without interest for the readers of the *CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW* to know the apostolic succession of the near predecessors of our present Archbishops, and who are not mentioned in the first list, since they all descend from Bishop Carroll.

Purcell, 1833, by Whitfield—Flaget—Carroll.

Elder, 1857, by F. P. Kenrick—Flaget, etc.

Wood, 1857, by Purcell.

Williams, 1866, by McCloskey—Hughes—Dubois—Maréchal—Carroll.

Perche, 1870, by Rosecrans—Purcell.

Corrigan, 1873, by McCloskey of New York.

Chapelle, 1891, by Cardinal Gibbons.

Quigley, 1897, by Corrigan.

The episcopal ancestry, or, as we may well call it, the apostolic succession of the American Hierarchy is, as Archbishop Ireland truly says, "a very interesting subject," the study of which offers more than one surprise to the close follower of our American Catholic history.

In view of the data furnished in the preceding pages, the question again arises, in what sense may Bishop Carroll be called the Father and Founder of the American Hierarchy? If regard be had to episcopal consecration only, it would seem that the appellation must be restricted to the Hierarchy of the original American States. But it may be allowed in a more general sense if we look to jurisdiction only. Yet, even this cannot apply to Oregon and California. When Bishop Carroll, after the resignation of Bishop Penalver y Cardenas of Louisiana, was made Administrator of Louisiana, in 1806, he held jurisdiction over all the territory then belonging to the United States. Bishop Dubourg in reality succeeded to Bishop Carroll in the episcopal jurisdiction of the diocese of Louisiana. All this is happily stated in a carefully worded passage by J. G. Shea, our American Catholic historian, when he says: "The Most Rev. John Carroll is the origin of the American Episcopate, as first bishop and subsequently first Archbishop of Baltimore, all dioceses East of the Mississippi having been formed from that confided to his care, and all archbishops and bishops succeeding to some part of his authority." (*The Catholic Hierarchy in the United States*, p. 61.) Again, speaking in the usual sense of the apostolic succession and episcopal ancestry of the present American Hierarchy, we are tempted, at first sight, to agree with *Acta et Dicta*, when it writes: "Other bishops of the United States received episcopal consecration, some in Europe and some in America, through other lineages. The two principal lineages, however, are those we have indicated—the Roman, through Cardinal Joseph Doria, and the English, through the Vicar Apostolic, Charles Walmesley."² . . . Yet, in reality the two lines

² *Acta et Dicta*, published by the Catholic Historical Society of St. Paul. Vol. iv, No. 1, July, 1915.

or approaches lead up to the same Roman portico with the difference of but one step. Bishop Dubourg was consecrated in the city of Rome, in the French Church of St. Louis, while Bishop Carroll was consecrated in England. But Carroll's consecrator, Bishop Walmesley, had also been consecrated at Rome, by Cardinal Lanti in the Sodality Chapel of the English College, in 1756.

There is an interesting notice in Griffin's *American Catholic Historical Researches* (1895, p. 94), stating that the late Bishop Maes of Covington had drawn up an "Ecclesiastical Genealogical Chart" showing the line of episcopal descent in the Catholic Hierarchy of the United States. The chart shows two principal lines of descent which are derived from Rome. The writer says that this remarkable chart is now in the Bishop's Memorial Hall of the Notre Dame University, Indiana.

In tracing the above episcopal pedigrees I have again, as on former occasions, experienced the great value of Reuss' *Biographical Cyclopedia of the Catholic Hierarchy of the United States*. From frequent correspondence with the author, I know that he was preparing a new corrected edition. Some capable person ought to take the work in hand and give us an up-to-date edition of this most valuable work. I shall gladly help.

✠ S. G. MESSMER,
Archbishop of Milwaukee.

II

A FRANK WORD ABOUT SOUTH AMERICAN HISTORY

One of the most distressing problems facing the American Catholic apologist today is the attitude of our Catholic scholars towards the history of the Church in Latin America. There has been a strange, almost childish, fear about touching this question; and the prospective apologist has been rebuffed with a priori finality by the statement: "You cannot get away from facts. The history of the Church in South America will not bear investigation." The consequence is that unjust attacks on Latin America have been met with the soothing generalization: "The Puritans killed off the Indians, while the Spanish missionaries preserved and Christianized them."

Students of history, who strive to be impartial in their attitude towards South America, ought to know that practically all the effective criticism on the Church there, dates from the unfortunate publication of one book: *Noticias Secretas de America*, written by Don Jorge Juan and Don Antonio de Ulloa. These two gentlemen were the naval officers detailed by the Spanish crown to accompany the scientific expedition of La Condamine to Quito, in 1735. Reports of their investigations were published in several scientific treatises and in an historico-scientific work entitled: *Viage á la America Meridional* (Madrid, 1749). In addition to this they made a secret report to Ferdinand VI on the conduct of the civil officials and ecclesiastics of Peru, and more especially of Quito, frankly noting abuses wherever they were found to exist. This report, which was made purely for the information of the King, was never intended to be made public, and remained in manuscript for about eighty years, until it was published, in London, in 1826, by an Anglo-Irishman, David Barry. The publication could